

Metadiscourse within a discipline: A study of introductions in marketing journal articles

Loi Chek Kim^{1*}, Chen Jung Ku @ Nur Alliyah Ku¹, Soon Chiow Thai², Lau Yoke Lian²

¹ Pusat Penataran Ilmu dan Bahasa, Universiti Malaysia Sabah, Kampus Antarabangsa Labuan, 87000 Labuan, Wilayah Persekutuan Labuan, Malaysia

² Pusat Penataran Ilmu dan Bahasa, Universiti Malaysia Sabah, Jalan UMS, 88400 Kota Kinabalu, Malaysia

*Corresponding Author: lck734@yahoo.com

Copyright©2023 by authors, all rights reserved. Authors agree that this article remains permanently open access under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License 4.0 International License

Received: 01 February 2023; Revised: 15 February 2023; Accepted: 01 March 2023; Published: 20 April 2023

Abstract: The present study examines the use of metadiscourse in the introductions of marketing research articles. The corpus for this study comprises 40 introductions of research articles. Hyland's (2004) model of metadiscourse has been employed as the analytical framework for the present study. The use of the different types of interactive and interactional metadiscourse in the set of introductions is looked at in addition to the use of the metadiscourse to realise the different communicative purposes in the introductions. The study is both quantitative and qualitative. Among other findings, the introductions are found to employ more interactive than interactional forms (average density of 0.78 vs. 0.52) that is the former is 1.5 times higher in number than the latter. In the interactive form of metadiscourse, evidentials (64.5% of all interactive uses) were the most frequent metadiscourse used in the introductions. The findings of the present study provide some insights into the teaching and learning of academic English writing for ESL (English as a Second Language) students.

Keywords: *Academic English Writing, Marketing Research Articles, Interactional, Interactive, Metadiscourse, Discipline*

1. Introduction

Metadiscourse can be defined as “a cover term for self-reflective expressions used to negotiate interactional meaning of text” [1]. The use of metadiscourse can enhance writers to engage the reader in a dialogic interaction (Hyland, 2005). Similarly, Crismore, et al., [2] noted that metadiscourse devices are linguistic items that can be used to realize the interpersonal and the textual function of language. Writers use textual functions to connect parts of ideational material within a text so that the meaning in context is explicit and logical to the readers [3-7], while they use interpersonal metadiscourse to convey ‘their personalities, their evaluations of and attitudes toward ideational material, shows what role in the communication situation they are choosing, and indicates

how they hope readers will respond to the ideational material’ [8].

Based on the above definitions, this article undertakes a study investigating the use of metadiscourse in academic writing, focusing on the introduction section of marketing research articles. The article first examines the average density of the interactive and interactional forms of metadiscourse used in the introductions and explore the realization of their communicative purposes in the introductions. The findings have pedagogical implications in teaching English academic writing to ESL students in the marketing field.

The research questions addressed in the present study are as follows:

1. What are the types of metadiscourse employed in the introductions of marketing journal articles?

Corresponding Author: Loi Chek Kim, Pusat Penataran Ilmu dan Bahasa, Universiti Malaysia Sabah, Kampus Antarabangsa Labuan, 87000 Labuan, Wilayah Persekutuan Labuan, Malaysia, 0173742836

2. What are the communicative purposes of the different types of metadiscourse employed in the introductions of marketing journal articles?

2. Literature Review

Several studies have examined the use of metadiscourse markers in various genres, including research articles [9-14]. However, much less attention has been paid to the use of metadiscourse in the writing of research articles from the field of marketing. This is the gap that the present study aims to fill by examining how metadiscourse is used within one discipline (i.e., marketing) by using [15]’s model of metadiscourse in academic texts. According to [15], metadiscourse is not simply ‘discourse about discourse’, but also comprises the ‘interactive’ element used by writers to ‘explicitly organize their texts, engage readers, and signal their attitudes to both their material and their audience’ [1], cited in [16]. Swales [17] has a similar view that an academic prose is ‘richly persuasive rather than flatly expository’. Hyland [15] divides metadiscourse used in academic texts to two categories, namely interactive resources and interactional resources. Interactive resources enable the writer to achieve explicit information flow based on the writer’s preferred interpretations, and this helps guide readers throughout the text [15-16]. In [15]’s model, the interactive resources include transitions, frame markers, endophoric markers, evidentials and code glosses. On the other hand, interactional resources, are used to ‘organize a discourse or the writer’s stance towards either its content or the reader’ [18] in order to help the writer involve himself in the text by conveying explicit information to the reader. In this way, interactional resources can help make the text more personal and easier for the reader to follow. In other words, these metadiscourse features control the level of personality in a text. The interactional resources comprise hedges, boosters, attitude markers, engagement markers and self-mentions. Hyland’s model of metadiscourse has been widely applied in studies on academic genres in general [19-23].

3. Methodology

This study is a combination of qualitative and quantitative research that includes both a quantitative data tabulated to illustrate the use of metatextual features and a description of the types of metatextual features found in the corpus. The corpus of the present study comprises the introductions of 40 marketing research articles selected from *The Journal of Marketing*. The journal is published by Sage Open. *The Journal of Marketing (JM)* develops and disseminates knowledge about real-world marketing questions relevant to scholars, educators, managers, consumers, policy makers and other societal stakeholders.

It is the premier outlet for substantive research in marketing. Since its founding in 1936, *JM* has played a significant role in shaping the content and boundaries of the marketing discipline. *JM* is included in the Financial Times Top 50 2016 Research Rank and the UT Dallas Journal List.

Initially, 60 articles were selected from the journal online based on judgment sampling. Using random-stratified sampling method, 40 articles were then extracted from the 60 articles to form the actual corpus of the present study. The 60 articles were first stratified into four subgroups based on the year of publication (2016-2019), followed by a simple random sampling to select articles from each of the four subgroups in proportion to their representation in the total population. Table 1 presents details of the selection of the marketing research articles.

Table 1. Selection of the corpus (marketing research articles)

Year of publication	Total populations (Judgment sampling)	Actual sample (Stratified sampling)
2016	18	12
2017	16	11
2018	14	9
2019	12	8
Total	60	40

The modest size of 40 RA introductions was considered to be justified, considering that the present study is a combination of qualitative and quantitative research which includes a description of the metatextual features and the presentation of quantitative data. Observations are restricted to the corpus. The present study thus does not attempt to generalize about the use of metadiscourse in introductions of research articles in the field of marketing.

4. Results and Discussion

The present study uses [15]’s model of metadiscourse in academic texts as a term of reference for the data analysis. As noted above, Hyland divides metadiscourse used in academic texts into two categories, namely interactive resources and interactional resources. The function of interactive resources (viz. transitions, frame markers, endophoric markers, evidentials and code glosses) is to help guide readers throughout the text. As for interactional resources (viz. hedges, boosters, attitude markers, engagement markers and self-mentions), their function is to involve the reader in the argument.

All occurrences were analyzed by considering the sentence context to ensure they acted as metadiscourse.

The results of the metadiscourse analysis were subjected to quantitative analysis, which included the following:

- the general distribution of metadiscourse in each category;
- the density of metadiscourse in each category.

The results use metadiscourse density to permit comparison across samples of different sizes. Metadiscourse density is defined as number of metadiscourse per sentence.

The findings show that in general, the corpus uses more interactive than interaction forms, similar to [13]'s study. The introductions use more interactive than interactional forms (average density of 0.78 vs. 0.52) that is the former is 1.5 times higher in number than the latter. In the interactive form of metadiscourse, evidentials (64.5% of all interactive uses) were the most frequent metadiscourse used in the introductions. This is followed by transitions (30% of all interactive uses), frame marker (17.3% of all interactive uses), code glosses (9.18% of all interactive uses), and endophonics (6.82% of all interactive uses). As for the interactional form of metadiscourse, boosters (37.8% of all interactional uses), hedges (30.5% of all interactional uses) and self-mention (24.1% of all interactional uses). Attitude markers are used the least by English writers (2.39% of all interactional uses). As shown, compared to attitude markers, self-mentions show quite a high frequency that is 15% of all interactional uses in the set of data. This may reflect that in this genre (academic writing), writers prefer to appeal to readers in a personal way by using by using the 'we-pronoun patterns' or using the 'animate subject construction' (e.g., We investigate...) instead of 'impersonal way using the inanimate subject construction' (e.g. The present study investigates. . .).

As noted above, the most frequent sub-category in the corpus is evidentials, which forms at least 64.5% of all interactive uses in the set of the data. The evidential forms used in the data are references to other sources to lay the groundwork for one's research and to support the writers' arguments or statements. Citations are used in most cases. Ahmad [24] suggests that the reader would think that the writer is well-informed about the literature context related to the domain of the study when sufficient citations are used to support the writer's statements. Some of the examples found in the corpora are as follows:

- (1) The marketing discipline is at a crossroads (Lehmann, McAlister, and Staelin 2011; Reibstein, Day and Wind 2009).
- (2) Drawing from previous conceptual work, we define a purchase mistake as a self-identified suboptimal decision whereby people purchase a product that subsequently fails to meet a threshold level of expected performance (Huei-Chen 2007; Laband, 1986; Murphy and Enis 1986).

As noted, there are also a great number of transitions in

the set of data that is, 30% of all interactive uses are found in the data. In the corpora, coordinating conjunctions such as 'and', 'or', 'thus' are used by writers to express the link between clauses. It is this link that allows writers to explicitly define the key concept or provide background information. Some examples are as follows:

(3) It is widely acknowledged that theories launch the fundamental knowledge of a discipline (Rust 2006) and are the building blocks for the maturation of a discipline.

(4) Data suggest that 76% of U.S. consumer goods sales organizations have undergone restructurings in the past three years (Allen, Ebrahim, and Kelly 2006), and researchers estimate that salesperson turnover rates reach 20%–30% annually... Transitions are also used to construct interaction. This reflects the feature of the inter-activeness of metadiscourse. Transitions such as conjunctions are used to (i) show cause and effect (e.g. 'and thus' as in Example 5) in order to provide rationale for a prior statement, (ii) provide justification for a proposal ('thus' as in Example 6); (iii) provide justification for a prediction ('because' as in Example 7); (iv) provide justification for a claim ('therefore' as in Example 8); (v) provide justification for a lack of research in the existing literature ('thus' as in Example 9):

(5) By definition, people who are low in trust generally consider human agents ill-intentioned or lacking in goodwill and thus are sceptical of the "statements or promises" made by human agents (Rotter 1967, p. 653)

(6) Provided that a lack of knowledge is temporary and, thus, fixable, we further propose that reviewers who admit to having made a mistake will prove especially likely to be seen as having rectified this lack of knowledge (i.e., to have gained expertise since the purchase mistake; we conceptualize expertise as a subcomponent of the broader construct of consumer knowledge in keeping with Alba and Hutchinson [1987])

(7) Because people assume that greater effort produces better outcomes (Kruger et al. 2004), we formally predict the following: ...

(8) The interpersonal relationship between a supplier's salesperson and the buying customer representative in particular is critical to establishing beneficial, long-term B2B exchanges (Gupta et al. 2019; Hartmann, Wieland, and Vargo 2018). Therefore, scholars suggest that preserving interpersonal relationships is key to ensure the growth of B2B firms (e.g., Ahearne, Bhattacharya, and Gruen 2005; Palmatier, Scheer, and Steenkamp 2007)

(9) Thus, the literature lacks research on organizational MC differentiation and its outcomes. This research gap is striking given its potential for gaining novel theoretical insights into ... Our goal is to address this research gap by focusing whether and how organizational MC differentiation affects relationships in the MC system...

The indication of research gap often led to the indication

of a need to carry out the current research as shown in the above Example 9. Transition is also used to indicate additional contributions of the study as show in the example below:

(10) This research offers several theoretical and managerial contributions to the brand anthropomorphization and price fairness literature. This study is the first to demonstrate that ... Furthermore, in this research, we investigate a different moderator- namely, agency-communion orientation- that is particularly relevant to the context of price fairness because judgments of fairness depend on the focus on the self

...

In the corpora, transitions such as the contrastive forms (e.g. 'however'; 'despite'; 'although', 'but' as well as a contrasting phrase such as "against this backdrop" are largely used to start off state ments of gap indication in the literature or counter-claiming. Such statements locate the current research in the context of previous research and debate by stating how the current study fills the past gap or justifying how the current research differs from previous work by proposing the current research or by highlighting the value of the current study. These contrastive forms are "antithetic discourse markers" that "exhibit connectivity and were sentence-initial concessive conjuncts appearing in the form of adversatives" [25]. The use of a contrastive at the beginning of the statements allows 'writers to manoeuvre themselves into line with what they expect reader may think to head off objections or counterclaims' [15]. According to [15], this is to gain more sympathy or acceptance from the readers on the writers' views. In this way, the presence of metadiscourse is to engage readers with the material rather than to help guide readers through the text [13]. Some of the examples found in the set of data are as follows:

(11) The interpersonal relationship between a supplier's salesperson and the buying customer representative in particular is critical to ... Therefore, scholars suggest that

... However, such interpersonal relationships can be easily disrupted (Boichuk et al. 2019; Panagopoulos, Mullins, and Avramidis 2018; Shi et al. 2017)... In response to this practical need and the scarcity of existing research, we (1) explore ... (2) propose a comprehensive contingency framework ...

(12) Some authors suggest negative effects of long-term interpersonal relationships (e.g., Anderson and Jap 2005; Grayson and Ambler 1999; Lund, Kozlenkova, and Palmatier 2015), but few studies specifically raise (and none empirically test) the possibility of beneficial effects of disruptions (Darmon 2008; Jap and Anderson 2007; Shi et al. 2017). We propose that ...

(13) Although firms typically choose their operational strategy based on economies of scale, inventory management, and fit with consumer preferences in mind (Cachon and Terwiesch 2013), this work is the first to demonstrate that the interaction of operational strategy and

production ethicality can have emotional consequences that then impact consumer behavior.

(14) Against this backdrop, our research sheds light on an overlooked issue: How can solution actors succeed in governance matching, such that they implement appropriate mechanisms to avoid or address the tensions that emerge from solution- specific features?

(15) Despite these successes, research has also presented opposite findings, showing that the presence (vs. absence) of a pleasant ambient scent increases or decreases expenditures by up to 60% (Madzharov, Block, and Morrin 2015; Morrin and Chebat 2005). ... Previous efforts to consolidate research findings are largely qualitative (e.g., Bone and Ellen 1999; Morrin 2010; Nibbe and Orth 2017)... Our analysis is focused on ... This, combined with a larger database, enables us to provide a thorough summary with rich and distinctive insight into ambient scent effects.

(16) Despite of the critical role that a product's aesthetic design plays in consumers' purchase decisions, there has been relatively little academic research on this topic in the marketing literature.

(17) The pioneering work of Gupta, Lehmann, and Stuart (2004; hereinafter GLS) was the first to explicitly link firm value to CLV for public companies. However, their treatment of the valuation problem suffers from two major issues.

(18) However, giving consumers a role in production also has the consequence of giving them direct responsibility over whether a product will be produced. For example, in the case of ... In this research, I argue that giving consumers control of production can prompt them to weigh ethical production attributes (e.g., recycled materials, pollution, underpaid labor) more heavily than when they simply choose premade products from inventory already in stores. As shown in Table 3, boosters instead of hedges are slightly heavily presented in the set of introductions [Boosters (37.8% of all interactional uses) and hedges (30.5% of all interactional uses)]. The use of a great number of boosters in the introductions suggests that both the writers are confident when they indicate both the gap of past research and the contribution of the present study as it is shown in their writing that they support their claims with evidence from past literature. The following exemplifies the above phenomenon:

(19) This research demonstrates that whether consumers do or do not participate in production can help explain this contradiction, ... Furthermore, this work answers recent calls in the *Journal of Marketing* for research on how agency and collective responsibility can encourage sustainable consumption (White, Habib, and Hardisty 2019). Importantly, this work contributes to the operations research literature.

(20) From a managerial standpoint, this study recommends actors to engage in governance engineering activities to succeed in solution development. They should take a learning-by-doing approach, monitoring and anticipating

the various evolutionary paths that...

Boosters are also used to highlight what is the most important objective in the research being examined ('most importantly' as in Example 21) and to highlight a gap that has been ignored in past studies ('largely' as in Example 22) as shown in the following example:

(21) Fourth, and most importantly, we discuss how text analysis can help "unite the tribes."

(22) On the other hand, the impact of product aesthetics on consumer preference has been largely ignored in modeling of consumer choice, ...

As noted above, relatively fewer hedges were found in the set of introductions. The following shows that hedges are used to make a logical and accurate/cautious judgement ('may as in Example 23); to show tentativeness of a claim when there is yet to have a definite answer/evidence/conclusion on the issue being discussed ('seem' as in Example 24; 'often seems', 'often', 'more like' and 'tends to' as in Example 25); ('might' as in Example 26) and to indicate the scarcity of a research area being examined in past studies ('only' in Example 27). As noted by [15], this sub-category of interactional form is used to 'withhold writer's full commitment to proposition' in order to establish 'a relationship with readers to persuade them of interpretations' [18] cited in [15]:

(23) Moreover, we illustrate what happens when governance matching fails and why solution development may take unplanned directions.

(24) This decision seems well founded: even among digital natives, 60% prefer to purchase offline (Chapman 2017).

(25) In reality, however, the field often seems fragmented. Rather than different rowers all simultaneously pulling together, it often feels more like separate tribes, each independently going off in separate directions. Although everyone is theoretically working toward similar goals, there tends to be more communication within groups than between them.

(26) With this study, we investigate how outcomes of an online purchase experience - purchase decision and amount of money spent (hereinafter referred to as "basket value") might depend on the browsing characteristics (number of pages viewed and time spent browsing) and ...

(27) Specifically, Campbell (2007) focuses only on the main effect of the human versus nonhuman source of information on price fairness, without delving deeper into boundary conditions of this effect. In contrast, our research adds substantial insights...

As it is shown, compared to boosters, hedges are not as heavily presented in marketing research article introductions. According to past Loi and Lim (2013), the use of a great number of hedges in the introductions

suggests that writers cautiously anticipate readers' reactions when indicating a gap or past research. That is, they appear to be aware of possible counter-argumentation from the readers, while seeking acceptance for their claims, according to Loi and Lim (2013). This is contrast to the present findings that lesser hedges compared to boosters are used. This could be that the different fields of the articles contribute to this differing feature. Writers in the field of marketing appear to be more confident, certain and persuasive in their claims with a more prominent emphatic tone as reflected in a higher use of the interactional form of metadiscourse. However, the similarity lies in the fact that all writers effectively use both boosters and hedges to a different extent to engage the reader in a dialogic interaction as noted by [26] that advanced writers can cautiously manipulate interactional strategies to achieve disciplinary expectations.

Code glosses were tended used by writers to support their arguments. Some of the code glosses used in the text are such as "for instance", "for example", etc. as shown in the following examples that the writer started a statement with "for instance" and "for example" to give an example to support on his argument/claim about a gap in the past research (Example 28 and Example 29) and to clearly clarify the past finding indicated earlier (Example 30):

(28) Extant solutions literature has not investigated the resulting governance issues, though some studies have indirectly suggested a key role of governance in determining the fate of solutions. For instance, to achieve the full potential of a solution, it is known that customers must share key resources with the supplier (Macdonald, Kleinaltenkamp, and Wilson 2016), and the supplier must take responsibility for tasks that the customer previously performed (Ulaga and Reinartz 2011).

(29) Nevertheless, still missing from prior research is an understanding of the effect of particular brand positioning strategies on consumer inferences of perceived price fairness. For example, Michelin, the world's second-largest tire maker, recently claimed that it was forced to raise prices to offset an increase in costs.

(30) Indeed, Aggarwal and McGill (2007) find that consumers evaluate an anthropomorphized product more positively when it possesses characteristics congruent with the corresponding human schema, provided this schema is positive. For example, participants considered a smiling (vs. frowning) car to be more congruent with the schema of a spokesperson and thus evaluated it more positively.

Endophoric markers such as 'Figure 1' are used to generally direct the readers to specific information. The following show an example:

(31) Figure 1 depicts the dynamic framework of solution development that we derive on the basis of this investigation; it also serves as a road map for the article.

On the other hand, frame markers are used to list out the characteristics of the subject of discussion ('first' and 'second' as in Example 32) and the contribution of the current study ('consequently' in Example 33, 'first' in Example 34 and 'first' in Example 35), to indicate in what ways the current study can benefit the readers, to present how the content is organized and presented in the article ('first', 'next' and 'subsequently' in Example 36) and to indicate the gaps of past studies clearly and systematically before the authors claim that the present study attempts to fill in these gaps ('first' and 'second' in Example 37):

(32) First, value in solution relationships is intensively coproduced in interactions between the supplier and the customer, who cannot simply exchange products or services but rather need to combine their key resources to cocreate an integrated offer (Vargo and Lusch 2016). ...Second, the service shift induces radical changes in relational habits, putting the customer at the center of the supplier's value proposition and altering tasks and duties attributed to suppliers and customers in the exchange (Worm et al. 2017).

(33) Consequently, text analysis can provide insights that may not be easily (or cost-effectively) obtainable through other methods.

(34) First, we illustrate how text data can be used for both prediction and understanding, to gain insight into who produced that text, as well as how that text may impact the people and organizations that consume it. Second, we provide a how-to guide for those new to text analysis, detailing the main tools, pitfalls, and challenges that researchers may encounter. Third, we offer...

(35) This work contributes to extant literature in four ways. First, by assessing customers' feelings of vulnerability, we provide a theoretical foundation for understanding how firms' data management practices affect customer behaviors and firm performance...

(36) This article is organized as follows: First, we give an overview of previous literature on retailer-manufacturer power relationships. Next, the models, data set, and results are presented that shed light on the retailer's and the manufacturer's vulnerability during the conflict delisting. Subsequently, we focus on the long-term consequences after the clash has come to ...

(37) The pioneering work of Gupta, Lehmann, and Stuart (2004; hereinafter GLS) was the first to explicitly link firm value to CLV for public companies. However, their treatment of the valuation problem suffers from two major issues. First, they performed their CLV calculations assuming ... Second, their valuation framework does not incorporate key financial/accounting issues such as ... Our objective is to present a framework for valuing subscription-based business.

Another type of markers "attitude markers" are found in smaller number in the sample (5.2 % of all interactional use). As shown in Example 38 ('not surprising') below, the

writer expressed that he was not surprised by the information as stated in the past literature. In other words, such information is expected and he then gave his rationale/justifications for the attitude he expressed as shown in the italicized statements:

(38) In executives' search for new ways to create a distinct and irreplaceable in-store experience, some focused on ambient scent (Minsky, Fahey, and Fabrigas 2018). This is not surprising. Scents have flavored our daily lives since ancient times, when pharaohs adorned themselves with lavish fragrances (Manniche 1999). In a world of digital reproducibility, a custom-made scent that offers an olfactory identity has become a thriving luxury business (Strauss 2015).

Self-mentions such as "we" are often employed by the writers to make their claims and state what they attempt to carry out in their study (15% of all interactional use). The 'we-pronoun' has been used extensively by the writers to start their statements that explain the framework and the work procedures employed in their research ('we' as in Example 39); to start the statement that presents the aim of the study ('we' as in Example 40), to begin the statement by justifying how the writers could fill the gaps of the past research in their current study ('we' as in Example 41); to start with a sentence that states the overview or the outline of the article ('we' as in Example 42); to begin the sentence by indicating the results of their study ('our' as in Example 43); to state what the writers propose in their study based on the prior given reason ('we' as in Example 44):

(39) We use the theoretical framework shown in Figure 1. We lay out the relationship between ambient scent and customer responses. We then explain how situational contingencies influence the effect sizes of customer responses (i.e., the standardized relationship between two variables, which we measured using the Pearson correlation coefficient; Durlak 2009).

(40) Within this emerging domain, we aim to make four main contributions.

(41) Whereas previous treatments of text analysis have looked specifically at consumer text (Humphreys and Wang 2017), social media communication (Kern et al. 2016), or psychological processes (Tausczik and Pennebaker 2010), we aim to provide a framework for incorporating text into marketing research at the individual, firm, market, and societal levels. By necessity, our approach includes a wide ranging set of textual data sources (e.g., user-generated content, annual reports, cultural artifacts, government text).

(42) We start by discussing two distinctions that are useful when thinking about how text can be used: (1) whether text reflects or impacts (i.e., says something about the producer or has a downstream impact on something else) and (2) whether text is used for prediction or understanding...

(43) Our results show support for good management and

penance mechanisms...

(44) Drawing on customization research across disciplines, including marketing and operations management, we propose that a supplier's project revenues and costs depend on the mechanisms it can use to coordinate customer interactions during the customization process.

Higher number of self-mentions "we" is used to explain what the writers examine, carry out and contribute in their study as shown in an example below:

(45) To test this conceptual model, we conduct three complementary studies. In Study 1, we run a series of experiments to delineate the effects of data access vulnerability from a customer's perspective. We examine how firms' mere access to customer information creates specific negative emotional and cognitive outcomes. By manipulating data access vulnerability, transparency, and control, we also provide a strong test of mitigation strategies.

Overall, there is a higher density of metadiscourse in the interactive form compared to the interactional form in the set of introductions (average density of 0.78 versus 0.52; about 1.5 times more). This shows that the writers pay more attention to help orient the readers in the logical development of text (interactive) to a greater extent compared to control the level of personality in a text (interactional) [1].

Generally, the studies reveal that metadiscourse use is influenced by the communicative and rhetorical functions of the introduction [23]. For example, in the introduction section, writers need to include sufficient background of the research areas and provide justifications for the current study by highlighting the centrality of the study and attempting to fill in the gaps in past studies (see examples presented earlier). In so doing, writers use evidentials and transitions to support their claims and arguments as well as to express their views and proposition accurately. The use of more interactive form of metadiscourse also reflects that the marketing research articles written in English is a writer-responsible prose. That is, writers are responsible to make the content and argument explicit in writing to facilitate the reader comprehension and to convince them of the argument brought forward. This is because academic writing involves processes more complex than 'technical matters in which "appropriate" skills are acquired and novices become members of an expert community'[27]. It also demands the acquisition of several linguistic practices which are embedded in complex sets of discourses, identities and social meanings. That is, in academic literacy practices, writers are required to be able to 'switch practices between one setting and another, to deploy a repertoire of linguistic practices appropriate to each setting and to handle the social meanings and identities that each evokes'[27]. This complexity makes it necessary for writers to organize their texts in manners that readers are most likely to

understand. The use of metadiscourse specifically in the interactive form is essential to enhance such understanding.

However, as seen above, the introductions employ relatively more self-mentions compared to the attitude markers in the interactional form. This shows that the writers do put emphasis in interacting with the reader by using the 'we' pronoun. The literature has shown that writers use self-mention in order to be more direct in their argumentation and voice [28,29].

5. Conclusion

The above findings show that the introductions in the field of marketing differ in the density of the type of metadiscourse used. A higher density of metadiscourse in the introductions is in the interactive form compared to the interactional form. In the interactive form, evidential and transitions are more frequently used compared to other types of metadiscourse, namely framemarkers, endophoric markers and code glosses.

For this reason, ESL students in the marketing field need to be aware of the importance of using evidentials (e.g., citations) and transitions (e.g., connectors) to support their arguments and to organize texts respectively. Students also need to realize that they should not ignore the use of the other form of metadiscourse that is, interactional form to engage the readers in a dialogic interaction using for example, boosters, hedges, and self-mentions. Teachers and language instructors can use an explicit approach in teaching metadiscourse markers by introducing students to both interactive and interactional forms of metadiscourse markers. As shown in the findings, an academic prose (e.g. research article introductions in the marketing field) is not only informative, but interactive and interactional to realize the writers' intention through their writing. Prior to writing students' own academic prose, they can be asked to engage in a metadiscourse analysis in research articles of their field. Generally, ESL students tend to use limited metadiscourse devices and use them in a superficial and mechanical [26]. The findings of this study thus will help students understand how metadiscourse can be applied in statements to realize the intended communicative purposes and to express propositions cohesively and coherently. Among other findings, take for example (see Examples 3-18 in the Results and Discussion section), transitions (i.e., the interactive form of metadiscourse) can be used to perform various communicative purposes effectively, namely to provide (i) rationale to a prior statement and (ii) justifications for a proposal, a claim, the scarcity of past research. It is believed that by using a teaching approach that creates student awareness, teaches metadiscourse markers explicitly and gives continuous practice and feedback, students can learn the use of metadiscourse in writing effectively [30].

The general aim of the study is to provide a description of marketing research article introductions in the use of

metadiscourse. The corpus of 40 marketing research article introductions is not small considering the qualitative and the quantitative nature of the study. However, the corpus does not provide sufficient findings to permit generalizations on the use of metadiscourse in the marketing research article introductions. One way to verify the results is to undertake future investigations that use larger sampled journal articles from different disciplines and in this case, a comparative study can also be undertaken to examine disciplinary difference.

4. Acknowledgements

I am grateful for comments given by colleagues to further improve this paper.

5. References

- [1] Hyland K, "Metadiscourse",2005. London: Continuum.
- [2] Crismore A, Markkanen R., MS., Steffenson, "Metadiscourse in Persuasive Writing: A Study of Texts Written by American and Finnish University Students," *Written Communication*, vol. 10, no.1, pp.39–71,1993.
- [3] Connor U., "Cross-Cultural Aspects of Second-language Writing," Cambridge: Cambridge, University Press, 1996.
- [4] Crismore A., E. Abdollezadeh, "A Review of Recent Metadiscourse Studies: The Iranian Context," *Nordic Journal of English Studies*, vol 9, no. 2, pp. 195–219, 2010.
- [5] Enkvist NE., "Seven Problems in the Study of Coherence and Interpretability," in: Connor U and Jones AM (eds) *Coherence in Writing: Research and Pedagogical Perspectives*, 1990.
- [6] Grabe WP., "Written Discourse Analysis," in Kaplan RB (ed.) *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics 5*. Rowley, MA: Newbury House, 1985, pp. 101–123.
- [7] Halliday MAK, R. Hasan, "Cohesion in English," London: Longman Group Ltd.,1976.
- [8] Vande Kopple W. J., "Metadiscourse, Discourse, and Issues in Composition and Rhetoric," in: Barton E and Stygall G (eds) *Discourse Studies in Composition*. Cresshill, NJ: Hampton Press,2002.
- [9] Birhan A.T., "An Exploration of Metadiscourse Usage in Book Review Articles across Three Academic Disciplines: a Contrastive Analysis of Corpus-Based Research Approach",2021.
- [10] Dahl T., "Textual Metadiscourse in Research Articles: A Marker of National Culture of Academic Discipline," *J. Pragmat.*,vol. 36, no. 10, pp. 1807-1825, 2004.
- [11] El-Dakhs D.A.S.. "Comparative Genre Analysis of Research Article Abstracts in More and Less Prestigious Journals," *Linguistics Journals in Focus. Res. Lang.* vol. 16, no. 1, pp. 47–63, 2018.
- [12] Khedri M., Heng C. S., S.F. Ebrahimi, "An Exploration of Interactive Metadiscourse Markers in Academic Research Article Abstracts into Disciplines," *Discourse Studies*, vol. 15, no. 3, pp. 319–331,2013.
- [13] Loi C. K., M.H. Jason, "Metadiscourse in English and Chinese Research Article Introductions," *Discourse Studies*, vol. 15,pp. 129-146, 2013. DOI: 10.1177/1461445612471476
- [14] Sultan H. A., "An Investigation of Metadiscourse Features in Applied Linguistic Academic Research Articles and Master's Dissertations," *Advances in Language and Literacy Studies*, vol.12, no. 1, pp. 47-54,2021.
- [15] Hyland K., "Disciplinary Interactions: Metadiscourse in L2 Postgraduate Writing," 2004.
- [16] Hyland, K., "Metadiscourse: Mapping Interaction in Academic Writing," *Nordic Journal of English Studies*, vol. 9, no. 2, pp. 125–143, 2010.
- [17] Swales J. M., "Research Genres: Exploration and Applications," Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004.
- [18] Hyland K., "Disciplinary Discourses: Social Interactions in Academic Writing," Harlow, Essex: Pearson Education Limited,2000.
- [19] Bal-Gezegin B., "A Corpus-Based Investigation of Metadiscourse in Academic Book Reviews," *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, vol. 232, pp. 713-718, 2016. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2016.10.097>
- [20] Lee J. J., E. Casal, "Metadiscourse in Results and Discussion Chapters: A Cross- Linguistic Analysis of English and Spanish Thesis Writers in Engineering," *System*, vol. 46, pp. 39- 54, 2014. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2014.07.009>
- [21] Ozdemir N. O., B. Longo, "Metadiscourse Use in Thesis Abstracts: A Cross-Cultural Study," *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, vol. 141, pp. 59-63.,2014. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.05.011>
- [22] Zadeh Z. R., Baharlooei, R., S. Simin, "Gender-Based Study of Interactive and Interactional Metadiscourse Markers in Conclusion Sections of English Master Theses".2015.
- [23] Akoto O. Y., "Metadiscourse Within a Discipline: A Study of Introduction and Literature Review Chapters of Sociology Masters' Theses," *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, vol.10, no.2, pp. 471-480,2020.
- [24] Ahmad UK., "Scientific Research Articles in Malay: A Situated Discourse Analysis," Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation, University of Michigan, 1997.
- [25] Lim J. M. H., "How Do Writers Establish Research Niches? A Genre-Based Investigation into Management Researchers' Rhetorical Steps and Linguistic Mechanisms," *Journal of English for Academic Purposes*, vol. 11, no. 3, pp. 229–245,2012.
- [26] El-Dakhs D.A.S., "Variation of Metadiscourse in L2 Writing: Focus on Language Proficiency and Learning Context," *Ampersand*, vol. 7, 2020. 100069.
- [27] Lea M. R., B., V. Street, "Student Writing in Higher Education: An Academic Literacies Approach," *Studies in Higher Education*, vol. 23, no. 2, pp. 157–172,1998.
- [28] Wu S.Y., D.L. Rubin, "Evaluating the Impact of Collectivism and Individualism on Argumentative Writing by Chinese and North American College Students," *Res. Teach. Engl.* Vol. 35, no. 2, 148–178, 2000.
- [29] Yan, L. D. Cahill, "The Rhetorical Organization of Chinese and American Students' Expository Essays: A Contrastive Rhetoric Study," *Int. J. Engl. Stud.* vol. 8, no. 2, pp. 113–132, 2008.
- [30] Taguchi N., "Instructed Pragmatics at a Glance: Where Instructional Studies Were, Are, and Should Be Going," *Lang. Teach.* Vol. 48, no. 1, pp. 1–50, 2015.